Micro-architectural attacks: from CPU to browser

Clémentine Maurice, CNRS, CRIStAL @BloodyTangerine 26 October 2022—RAID 2022 keynote



Execution leaves traces in components



Inspecting these traces allows retrieving secrets!



This requires surgical precision and a great control over CPU components...



OS



This requires surgical precision and a great control over CPU components...

hardware



hardware usually modeled as an abstract layer behaving correctly

• hardware usually modeled as an abstract layer behaving correctly, but possible attacks

- hardware usually modeled as an abstract layer behaving correctly, but possible attacks
 - faults: bypassing software protections by causing hardware errors
 - side channels: observing side effects of hardware on computations

- hardware usually modeled as an abstract layer behaving correctly, but possible attacks
 - faults: bypassing software protections by causing hardware errors
 - side channels: observing side effects of hardware on computations



- hardware usually modeled as an abstract layer behaving correctly, but possible attacks
 - faults: bypassing software protections by causing hardware errors
 - side channels: observing side effects of hardware on computations



attack



- retrieving secret keys, keystroke timings
- bypassing OS security (ASLR)

Hardware-based attacks a.k.a physical attacks



VS

Software-based attacks a.k.a micro-architectural attacks



Physical access to hardware \rightarrow embedded devices

Co-located or remote attacker \rightarrow complex systems

From small optimizations...



• new microarchitectures yearly

From small optimizations...



- new microarchitectures yearly
- + performance improvement $\approx 5\%$

From small optimizations...



- new microarchitectures yearly
- performance improvement $\approx 5\%$
- very small optimizations: caches, branch prediction...

• microarchitectural side channels come from these optimizations

- microarchitectural side channels come from these optimizations
- several processes are sharing microarchitectural components

- microarchitectural side channels come from these optimizations
- several processes are sharing microarchitectural components
- attacker infers information from a (vulnerable) victim process via hardware usage

- microarchitectural side channels come from these optimizations
- several processes are sharing microarchitectural components
- attacker infers information from a (vulnerable) victim process via hardware usage
- pure-software attacks by unprivileged processes

- microarchitectural side channels come from these optimizations
- several processes are sharing microarchitectural components
- attacker infers information from a (vulnerable) victim process via hardware usage
- pure-software attacks by unprivileged processes
- + sequences of benign-looking actions \rightarrow hard to detect

Side-channel attacks







Overview of micro-architectural attacks

Overview of micro-architectural attacks

Porting micro-architectural attacks to the Web

Overview of micro-architectural attacks

Implementation



```
Algorithm 1: Square-and-multiply exponentiationInput: base b, exponent e, modulus nOutput: b^e \mod nX \leftarrow 1for i \leftarrow bitlen(e) downto 0 doX \leftarrow multiply(X, X)if e_i = 1 then| X \leftarrow multiply(X, b)|end
```

ena

return X





Hardware

1. Which software implementation is vulnerable?

2. Which hardware component is vulnerable?

State of the art (more or less)

- 1. Spend too much time reading OpenSSL code
- 2. Find vulnerability
- 3. Exploit it manually using known side channel \rightarrow e.g. CPU cache
- 4. Publish
- 5. goto step 1

For example: CVE-2016-0702, CVE-2016-2178, CVE-2016-7440, CVE-2016-7439, CVE-2016-7438, CVE-2018-0495,

CVE-2018-0737, CVE-2018-10846, CVE-2019-9495, CVE-2019-13627, CVE-2019-13628, CVE-2019-13629,



State of the art (more or less)

- 1. Spend too much time reading Intel manuals
- 2. Find weird behavior in corner cases
- 3. Exploit it using a known vulnerability
- 4. Publish
- 5. goto step 1



Shared hardware



Each component shared by two processes is a potential micro-architectural side-channel vector • threads sharing one core share resources: L1, L2 cache, branch predictor, TLB...



- instructions are decomposed in uops to optimize Out-of-Order execution
- uops are dispatched to specialized execution units through CPU ports
- deterministic decomposition of instructions into uops



Port contention

No contention



All attacker instructions are executed in a row

 \rightarrow fast execution time

A. C. Aldaya et al. "Port Contention for Fun and Profit". In: S&P. 2019.

Port contention

No contention



Contention



All attacker instructions are executed in a row

 \rightarrow fast execution time

Victim instructions delay the attacker instructions \rightarrow slow execution time

A. C. Aldaya et al. "Port Contention for Fun and Profit". In: S&P. 2019.





Port contention side-channel attack





Secret is 0!

Port contention side-channel attack


- end-to-end attack on a TLS server (OpenSSL 1.1.0h): recovers a P-384 ECDSA private key
 - \rightarrow secret dependent on double-and-add operations of ec_wNAF_mul point multiplication
- SMoTherSpectre, a speculative code-reuse attack

A. C. Aldaya et al. "Port Contention for Fun and Profit". In: S&P. 2019.

A. Bhattacharyya et al. "SMoTherSpectre: Exploiting Speculative Execution through Port Contention". In: CCS. 2019.

Possible side channels using components shared by a core?

Possible side channels using components shared by a core?

Stop sharing a core!

• cores also share resources: L3 cache, Ring Interconnect, GPU...





From theoretical to practical cache attacks

- first theoretical attack in 1996 by Kocher
- first practical attack on RSA in 2005 by Percival, on AES in 2006 by Osvik et al.
- renewed interest for the field in 2014 after Flush+Reload by Yarom and Falkner
- \cdot even more interest in 2018 after the disclosure of Spectre and Meltdown

P. C. Kocher. "Timing Attacks on Implementations of Diffe-Hellman, RSA, DSS, and Other Systems". In: Crypto'96. 1996.

C. Percival. "Cache missing for fun and profit". In: Proceedings of BSDCan. 2005.

D. A. Osvik, A. Shamir, and E. Tromer. "Cache Attacks and Countermeasures: the Case of AES". In: CT-RSA 2006. 2006.

Y. Yarom and K. Falkner. "Flush+Reload: a High Resolution, Low Noise, L3 Cache Side-Channel Attack". In: USENIX Security Symposium. 2014.

P. Kocher et al. "Spectre Attacks: Exploiting Speculative Execution". In: S&P. 2019.

M. Lipp et al. "Meltdown: Reading Kernel Memory from User Space". In: USENIX Security Symposium. 2018.

V

/ictim address space	Cache					or address o	
Cacile Cacile					ALLAC	ker address s	pace

Step 1: Attacker maps shared library (shared memory, in cache)



Step 1: Attacker maps shared library (shared memory, in cache)



Step 1: Attacker maps shared library (shared memory, in cache)

Step 2: Attacker flushes the shared cache line



Step 1: Attacker maps shared library (shared memory, in cache)

Step 2: Attacker flushes the shared cache line

Step 3: Victim loads the data



Step 1: Attacker maps shared library (shared memory, in cache)

Step 2: Attacker flushes the shared cache line

Step 3: Victim loads the data

Step 4: Attacker reloads the data

Flush+Reload: Applications

- side channel attacks on cryptographic primitives:
 - RSA: 96.7% of secret key bits in a single signature
 - AES: full key recovery in 30000 dec. (a few seconds)
- attacks against pseudorandom number generators
- attacks against RSA key generation
- revival of Bleichenbacher attacks on TLS

Y. Yarom and K. Falkner. "Flush+Reload: a High Resolution, Low Noise, L3 Cache Side-Channel Attack". In: USENIX Security Symposium. 2014.

B. Gülmezoglu et al. "A Faster and More Realistic Flush+Reload Attack on AES". In: COSADE. 2015.

S. Cohney et al. "Pseudorandom Black Swans: Cache Attacks on CTR_DRBG". In: S&P. 2020.

A. C. Aldaya et al. "Cache-Timing Attacks on RSA Key Generation". In: TCHES (2019).

E. Ronen et al. "The 9 Lives of Bleichenbacher's CAT: New Cache ATtacks on TLS Implementations". In: S&P. 2019.

Possible side channels using memory deduplication?

Possible side channels using memory deduplication?

Disable memory deduplication!

Victim address space

Cache

Attacker address space



Step 1: Attacker primes, *i.e.*, fills, the cache (no shared memory)



Step 1: Attacker **primes**, *i.e.*, fills, the cache (no shared memory)

Step 2: Victim evicts cache lines while running



Step 1: Attacker **primes**, *i.e.*, fills, the cache (no shared memory)

Step 2: Victim evicts cache lines while running



Step 1: Attacker **primes**, *i.e.*, fills, the cache (no shared memory)

Step 2: Victim evicts cache lines while running

Step 3: Attacker probes data to determine if set has been accessed



Step 1: Attacker **primes**, *i.e.*, fills, the cache (no shared memory)

Step 2: Victim evicts cache lines while running

Step 3: Attacker probes data to determine if set has been accessed

We need to evict caches lines without **clflush** or shared memory:

- 1. which addresses do we access to have congruent cache lines?
- 2. without any privilege?
- 3. and in which order do we access them?

We need:

- 1. an eviction set: addresses in the same set, in the same slice (issue #1 and #2)
- 2. an eviction strategy (issue #3)

- cross-VM side channel attacks on crypto implementations:
 - El Gamal (sliding window): full key recovery in 12 min.
- covert channels between virtual machines in the cloud

F. Liu et al. "Last-Level Cache Side-Channel Attacks are Practical". In: S&P'15. 2015.

C. Maurice et al. "Hello from the Other Side: SSH over Robust Cache Covert Channels in the Cloud". In: *NDSS*'17. 2017. Y. Oren et al. "The Spv in the Sandbox: Practical Cache Attacks in JavaScript and their Implications". In: CCS'15. 2015.

- cross-VM side channel attacks on crypto implementations:
 - El Gamal (sliding window): full key recovery in 12 min.
- \cdot covert channels between virtual machines in the cloud
- tracking user behavior in the browser, in JavaScript

F. Liu et al. "Last-Level Cache Side-Channel Attacks are Practical". In: S&P'15. 2015.

C. Maurice et al. "Hello from the Other Side: SSH over Robust Cache Covert Channels in the Cloud". In: *NDSS'17*. 2017. Y. Oren et al. "The Spv in the Sandbox: Practical Cache Attacks in JavaScript and their Implications". In: *CCS'15*. 2015.

Possible side channels using components shared by a CPU?

Possible side channels using components shared by a CPU?

Stop sharing a CPU!?

Cross-CPU attacks!

• CPUs also share resources: DRAM



Porting micro-architectural attacks to the Web



Porting micro-architectural attacks to the Web

• side-channel attacks on the cache, DRAM, MMU, (...), and transient execution attacks like Spectre, ret2spec, RIDL, (...), are coming to web browsers



- very low-level attacks in a high-level language with many abstraction layers in between
- complex but not impossible to perform
- $\cdot\,$ fundamentally hard or impossible to fix in the browser

T. Rokicki, C. Maurice, and P. Laperdrix. "Sok: In search of lost time: A review of javascript timers in browsers". In: EuroS&P'21. 2021

• side channels are only doing benign operations

- side channels are only doing benign operations
 - all side-channel attacks: measuring time

- side channels are only doing benign operations
 - all side-channel attacks: measuring time
 - cache attacks: accessing their own memory
 - port contention attacks: executing specific instructions

Measuring time

• measure small timing differences: need a high-resolution timer

- measure small timing differences: need a high-resolution timer
- native: **rdtsc**, timestamp in CPU cycles

- measure small timing differences: need a high-resolution timer
- native: **rdtsc**, timestamp in CPU cycles
- JavaScript: performance.now() has the highest resolution
- measure small timing differences: need a high-resolution timer
- native: **rdtsc**, timestamp in CPU cycles
- JavaScript: performance.now() has the highest resolution

performance.now()

[...] represent times as floating-point numbers with up to microsecond precision. — Mozilla Developer Network

Evolution of timers until today



T. Rokicki, C. Maurice, and P. Laperdrix. "Sok: In search of lost time: A review of javascript timers in browsers". In: EuroS&P'21. 2021

• before September 2015: performance.now() had a nanosecond resolution

Y. Oren et al. "The Spy in the Sandbox: Practical Cache Attacks in JavaScript and their Implications". In: CCS'15. 2015. https://www.mozilla.org/en-US/security/advisories/mfsa2015-114/

- before September 2015: performance.now() had a nanosecond resolution
- Oren et al. demonstrated cache side-channel attacks in JavaScript

Y. Oren et al. "The Spy in the Sandbox: Practical Cache Attacks in JavaScript and their Implications". In: CCS'15. 2015. https://www.mozilla.org/en-US/security/advisories/mfsa2015-114/

- before September 2015: performance.now() had a nanosecond resolution
- Oren et al. demonstrated cache side-channel attacks in JavaScript
- "fixed" in Firefox 41: rounding to 5 μs

Y. Oren et al. "The Spy in the Sandbox: Practical Cache Attacks in JavaScript and their Implications". In: CCS'15. 2015. https://www.mozilla.org/en-US/security/advisories/mfsa2015-114/

microsecond resolution is not enough

M. Schwarz et al. "Fantastic Timers and Where to Find Them: High-Resolution Microarchitectural Attacks in JavaScript". In: FC. 2017.

- microsecond resolution is not enough
- two approaches

M. Schwarz et al. "Fantastic Timers and Where to Find Them: High-Resolution Microarchitectural Attacks in JavaScript". In: FC. 2017.

- microsecond resolution is not enough
- two approaches
 - 1. recover a higher resolution from the available timer

M. Schwarz et al. "Fantastic Timers and Where to Find Them: High-Resolution Microarchitectural Attacks in JavaScript". In: FC. 2017.

- microsecond resolution is not enough
- two approaches
 - 1. recover a higher resolution from the available timer
 - 2. build our own high-resolution timer

M. Schwarz et al. "Fantastic Timers and Where to Find Them: High-Resolution Microarchitectural Attacks in JavaScript". In: FC. 2017.





• measure how often we can increment a variable between two timer ticks



• to measure with high resolution



- to measure with high resolution
 - start measurement at clock edge



- to measure with high resolution
 - start measurement at clock edge
 - increment a variable until next clock edge



- to measure with high resolution
 - start measurement at clock edge
 - increment a variable until next clock edge
- Firefox/Chrome: 500 ns, Tor: 15 μs

feature to share data: SharedArrayBuffer

- feature to share data: SharedArrayBuffer
- web worker can simultaneously read/write data

- feature to share data: SharedArrayBuffer
- web worker can simultaneously read/write data
- no message passing overhead

- feature to share data: SharedArrayBuffer
- web worker can simultaneously read/write data
- no message passing overhead
- \cdot one dedicated worker for incrementing the shared variable

- feature to share data: SharedArrayBuffer
- web worker can simultaneously read/write data
- no message passing overhead
- one dedicated worker for incrementing the shared variable
- Firefox/Fuzzyfox: 2 ns, Chrome: 15 ns



- lowering timer resolution is not enough
- adding jitter \rightarrow makes clock interpolation inefficient (need to redo the measurements to get rid of noise)



T. Rokicki, C. Maurice, and P. Laperdrix. "Sok: In search of lost time: A review of javascript timers in browsers". In: EuroS&P'21. 2021

Jitter?

- lowering timer resolution is not enough
- adding jitter \rightarrow makes clock interpolation inefficient (need to redo the measurements to get rid of noise)
- \rightarrow has no impact on SharedArrayBuffers!



T. Rokicki, C. Maurice, and P. Laperdrix. "Sok: In search of lost time: A review of javascript timers in browsers". In: EuroS&P'21. 2021

Jitter?



- adding jitter \rightarrow makes clock interpolation inefficient (need to redo the measurements to get rid of noise)
- \rightarrow has no impact on SharedArrayBuffers!
 - browsers are adopting better isolation between websites (e.g., Site Isolation) to counter transient execution attacks
 - back to higher timer resolution for usability \rightarrow side-channel attacks are possible again!



Cache attacks in browsers

Cache attacks: Challenges with JavaScript







1. No high-resolution timers

2. No instruction to flush the cache

3. No knowledge about physical addresses

Eviction sets in JavaScript



 \rightarrow we can distinguish cache hits from cache misses (only \approx 150 cycles difference)!

M. Schwarz et al. "Fantastic Timers and Where to Find Them: High-Resolution Microarchitectural Attacks in JavaScript". In: FC. 2017.

Cache attacks in JavaScript: applications

- spying on user behavior: detect mouse and network activity
- covert channel across origins
- covert channel host-to-VM
- \cdot website fingerprinting



Y. Oren et al. "The Spy in the Sandbox: Practical Cache Attacks in JavaScript and their Implications". In: CCS'15. 2015.

A. Shusterman et al. "Robust Website Fingerprinting Through the Cache Occupancy Channel". In: USENIX Security Symposium. 2019.

Other micro-architectural attacks in browsers?

Other micro-architectural attacks in browsers



Daniel Gruss³, Werner Haas⁶, Mike Hamburg⁷, Moritz Lipp⁷, Stefan Mangard⁶, Thomas Prescher⁶, Michael Schwar⁵, Yuval Yarom⁸ ¹ Independent www.paukohencorom,² Google Project Zero, ³ G DATA Advanced Analytics, ⁴ University of Pennsylvania and University of Maryland, ⁶ Graz University of Technology, ⁶ Cyberns Technology,

Bonus: you don't even need JavaScript!



A. Shusterman et al. "Prime+Probe 1, JavaScript 0: Overcoming Browser-based Side-Channel Defenses". In: USENIX Security Symposium. 2021.

• first paper by Kocher in 1996: 25 years of research in this area

- first paper by Kocher in 1996: 25 years of research in this area
- domain still in expansion: increasing number of papers published since 2015

- first paper by Kocher in 1996: 25 years of research in this area
- domain still in expansion: increasing number of papers published since 2015
- any shared component is a potential side-channel vector

- first paper by Kocher in 1996: 25 years of research in this area
- domain still in expansion: increasing number of papers published since 2015
- any shared component is a potential side-channel vector
- $\cdot\,$ it's really hard not to share a component

- first paper by Kocher in 1996: 25 years of research in this area
- domain still in expansion: increasing number of papers published since 2015
- any shared component is a potential side-channel vector
- it's **really** hard not to share a component
- micro-architectural attacks require a low-level understanding and control over the components, usually achieved with native code

- first paper by Kocher in 1996: 25 years of research in this area
- domain still in expansion: increasing number of papers published since 2015
- any shared component is a potential side-channel vector
- it's **really** hard not to share a component
- micro-architectural attacks require a low-level understanding and control over the components, usually achieved with native code
- but it's still possible to carry these attacks on from web browsers



Contact

- ✓ clementine.maurice@inria.fr
- ♥ @BloodyTangerine

Micro-architectural attacks: from CPU to browser

Clémentine Maurice, CNRS, CRIStAL @BloodyTangerine 26 October 2022—RAID 2022 keynote